

# Controversy and Arguments for The Application of Rasm 'Utsmānī On The Mushaf of The Qur'an

## Sopyan Hadi<sup>1</sup>, Rifanto Bin Ridwan<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Fakultas Agama Islam Universitas Pamulang, Indonesia <sup>2</sup>Institut Agama Islam Negeri Curup, Indonesia Correspondence: dosen00292@unpam.ac.id

DOI: 10.29240/alquds.v9i1.13254

**Abstract:** This paper presents information about the orthography controversy of the mushaf that was written and compiled during the time of Caliph 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, also known as the rasm 'uthmānī, due to the political intervention in the process of codification. The script style of Rasm 'uthmānī represents a cultural heritage of early Arabic writing closely linked to the generation of the Prophet's companions. During the early period of its promulgation, many non-Arab Muslims struggled with correctly reading the mushaf. As a result, the 'uthmānī *mushaf* underwent improvements incorporating standardised Arabic writing rules and ultimately became the global standard for Muslims. This paper also addresses the arguments supporting the policy of implementing Rasm 'uthmānī in the writing of the mushaf al-Qur'an. The method used in this research is in the form qualitative descriptive analytical research, namely research that seeks to provide a complete picture as well as explore in depth the aspect that have relevance to the controversy of the rasm 'utsmānī which is a literature study, where data or data sources are taken based on and classical books, books, and articles.

Keywords: Rasm 'uthmānī, rules, law

#### Introduction

According to Ṣubḥi al-Ṣāliḥ, in his book Mabāḥits fi' Ulūm al-Qur'ān, the Qur'an is the divine kalam revealed to the Prophet Muḥammad Saw and written in muṣḥaf based on mutawatir sources that are certain to be true. Reciting it for Muslims is worship.¹ Moreover, Tadjab, quoting Muhammad 'Abduh's opinion, defines the Qur'an as a noble kalam revealed by Allah to the most perfect prophet (Muḥammad Saw), whose teachings encompass all science. It is a glorious source whose essence is incomprehensible except to the pure soul and the intellectual.² In the history of its descent, according to Rosihon Anwar, quoting his opinion, Ibn' Abbas and a group of other companions, stated that the Qur'an was revealed at once from lauḥ al-maḥfuz to the temple of al-'izzah (the heavens of the earth). After that, the Qur'an gradually descended to the Prophet Muḥammad Saw for 23 years in line with the events since the Prophet was sent until his death.³

Whenever he received a revelation, the Prophet PBUH memorised it carefully. Given that the ability of the Arabs to memorise was powerful at that time, the power of memorisation became the first way to preserve the Quran. In other words, the Quran is a revelation revealed verbally through the Angel Jibrīl to the Prophet Muḥammad, which was then written in Arabic. The Companions on palm fronds, bones, thin stones, etc, wrote the Quran. According to Muqsith Ghazali, the writing of these verses of the Quran is believed to have begun when the Prophet (peace be upon him) was in Mecca. Still, the writing of the Quran more systematically only began in Medina, especially after the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Şubḥi al-Ṣāliḥ, *Discussing the Sciences of the Qur'an*, Translator: Pustaka Firdaus Team (Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1993), p. 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Tadjab, et al., *Dimensions of Islamic Studies* (Surabaya: Karya Abditama, 1994), p. 88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Rosihon Anwar, Introduction to Ulumul Qur'an (Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2009), p. 10.

Prophet officially appointed some of his companions to carry out this task, namely Mu'awiyah bin Abī Sufyān, Ubay bin Ka'āb, Zayd bin Tsabit, and 'Abd Allāh bin Mas'ūd. This effort is the second way the Prophet (peace be upon him) and his companions maintained the Qur'an. So, it can be said that the maintenance of the Qur'an has been carried out since the time of the Prophet (saw) until the time of the caliphate of Uthman bin' Affān (623-635 AD), starting from memorisation, writing, and codification of the Qur'an.<sup>5</sup>

Preserving the Qur'an in written form was stopped when the Prophet PBUH died. Then Abū Bakr was appointed as the Caliph, the successor of the Prophet (peace be upon him). At the beginning of the collection of the Qur'an (al-jam'u al-Qur'an), Zayd bin Tsabit was ordered by Caliph Abū Bakr to collect the scattered Qur'an to become one musaf. At first, Zavd rejected this, arguing that the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) never advocated such a thing. However, after various considerations, the Our'an pages were finally collected into one mushaf. However, in the last phase of the collection of the Qur'an – i.e. during the caliphate of 'Uthman ibn' Affān – where non-Arab Muslims had spread widely to several regions of the Arabian Peninsula, there was still an error in reading the writings of the Qur'an, rasm 'utsmānī, which were still in the form of pure Arabic writing or scriptio defectiva (Arabic writing that had no dots and syaks). So, there are many fundamental errors in terms of the reading of the Qur'an, aggravated by each group of Muslims considering their reading to be the most correct.

Finally, 'Utsman and the scholars of the time worked hard to correct the writings of the Qur'an rasm 'utsmānī so that non-Arab Muslims could read them correctly. From this codification process, it is assumed that Rasm 'utsmānī is the result of a policy of political authority carried out by Uthman bin' Affan through the aristocracy—the Quraysh ethnicity. So during the caliphate of Mu'wiyah bin Abī Sufyān (661-680), this step began to be taken. Ziyād ibn Samiyah (d. 673), who was the Governor of Basrah at the time, asked an Arabic linguist named Abū Aswād al-Du'ālī (c. 605-688) to put the basics of the Arabic language in the form of punctuation into the Qur'an's rasm 'utsmānī for the first time. Then the refinement of the writings of the Qur'an rasm 'utsmānī continued until it was completed at the end of the 3rd century A.D. This process made significant progress at the beginning of the 4th/10th century A.D., with the acceptance of Ibn Mujāhid's idea of qirā'ah sab'ah, and culminated in 1923 with the publication of the standard Egyptian Qur'an, which became the role model of the majority of Muslims.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Abd Mogsith Ghazali, et al., Methodology of Qur'an Studies (Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2009), p. 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The codification of the Qur'an during the reign of Caliph 'Uthman bin 'Affān, which lasted for 12 years, is the most phenomenal work in the history of Islam. Although on his journey, 'Uthman bin 'Affān was a Caliph known by some Muslims as a nepotist head of state and easily persuaded by the requests of his family who were also part of government officials. However, the services of 'Uthman to the progress of Islamic civilization, especially in terms of the codification of the Qur'an, were so great. See: Armany Lubis et al., History of Islamic Civilization (Jakarta: Center for Women's Studies (PSW) UIN Jakarta, 2005), p.58-59

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Eva Nugraha, *The Concept of the Prophet al-Ummi and Its Implications on Rasim Writing*, Journal of Reflection Volume 13, Number 2, April 2012, p. 275.

With his efforts, 'Utsman bin 'Affan laid the first foundation, which is called the knowledge of rasm al-Qur'an or the knowledge of rasm 'utsmānī. See: Abdul Djalal, Ulumul Qur'an (Surabaya: Dunia Ilmu, 2000), p.29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Muhammad Ansori, "Political Authority in the Codification of Mushaf in the Time of the Caliph al Rasidin", Ilmu Ushuluddin, Vol. 18, no. 2, July-December 2019, p. 202-203.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Taufik Adnan Amal, Reconstructing the History of the Qur'an (Jakarta: Pustaka Alvabet, 2005), p. 320. At first, Abū Aswād al-Du'ālī refused to correct the text of muṣḥaf 'utsmānī, this was based on the same reason as Zayd bin Tsabit, namely that there was no recommendation from the Prophet to do so. However, after al-Du'ālī saw for himself the errors in the reading of mushaf 'utsmānī by Muslims in various regions, he finally undertook to correct the text of mushaf 'utsmānī.

The above history raises the question: Is Rasm 'utsmānī a taugifi or ijtihad of the Companions? This question was answered by Nunung Lasmana (2017). He tried to trace whether the codification of Rasm 'utsmānī as a single mushaf used as a reference for Muslims based on tauqifi or vice versa, i.e. the ijtihad of the Companions; however, Lasmana concluded that the Ottoman mushaf contained the value of taugifi or divine essence, which lies in the format and structure of the Qur'an. 10 Meanwhile, Abdul Hakim (2018) chose to collaborate between rasm, qiroat, dabt, and waqf in copying the writing of the Qur'an to prove the origin of the rasm of the Qur'an. 11

Muhammad Ansori (2019) also researched the debate on using Rasm 'utsmānī as a standard for the Qur'anic mushaf. He explored the motive of Uthman bin 'Affān's policy of standardising the mushaf and used a historical approach to his analysis. 12 In addition, Nadia Sari, Jusnita, and Bilfahmi Putra (2025) also tried to analyse the ancient manuscripts of Shaykh Ibrahim Mufti, who was concerned with rasm 'utsmānī, by using a philological approach in Surau Tuo Regency, Fifty Cities. The research shows that there is a difference between the standard *Indonesian mushaf 'utsmānī* rasm and the 'utsmānī rasm in the ancient manuscripts of Shaykh Ibrahim Mufti. 13

Some of the studies on rasm 'utsmānī above show the importance of studying the use of rasm 'utsmānī in the writing of the Qur'anic mushaf. Therefore, this study will focus on the argument over the application of Rasm 'utsmānī in the mushaf of the Quran. This research is studied qualitatively with a descriptive-analytical method, which seeks to provide a complete picture and an in-depth exploration of aspects relevant to the Rasm' utsmānī controversy. Data is collected from literature (library research), such as classic books, articles, and other sources.<sup>14</sup>

#### Discussion

## The Concept of Rasm in the Mushaf of the Qur'an

Etymologically, rasm is a masdar form of , which means to draw, design, write, or paint. The pronunciation of rasm is synonymous (muradif) with the pronunciation of khatt, kitābah, satr and ragm. Thus, Rasm can also be interpreted as a writing model (design). According to Hasanuddin, rasm is a provision or pattern used by 'Utsmān bin' Affān and other companions in the writing of the Qur'an, about the arrangement of its letters, which are contained in the mushaf-mushaf sent to various regions and cities, as well as the mush of al-imām, which is in the hands of 'Uthmān bin 'Affān himself. 15 In line with this opinion, Manna' al-Qattan interprets rasm as the writing of the Qur'an with a special method taken by Zayd bin Tsabit with three Quraish, namely Ubay bin Ka'ab, 'Alī bin Abī Tālib and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Nunung Lasmana, "The Symbolic Phenomenology of the Qur'an: Epistemological Criticism of the Introductory Book of the Phenomenology of the Qur'an with the Scientific Dimension Behind the Usmanian Mushaf', Qof Journal, Volume 1 Number 2 July 2017: p. 97.

<sup>11</sup> Abdul Hakim, "Methods of Studying Rasm, Qiroaat, Waqf and Dabt in Ancient Mushaf" Journal of Subuf Ministry of Religion, Volume 11, No. 1 June 2018: p. 80.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Muhammad Ansori, "Political Authority in the Codification of Mushaf in the Time of the Caliph al Rasidin", Ushuluddin Science, Vol. 18, no. 2, July-December: p. 200.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Nadia Sari et al, "Rasm Analysis of the Ancient Qur'an Manuscript by Shaykh Ibrahim Mufti in Surau Tuo Regency Fifty Cities" Al Fahmu: Journal of Al Quran Science and Tafsir, Vol. 4, Number 1, Year 2025: p. 28-29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Lexy J. Moleong, *Qualitative Research Methodology* (Bandung: Rosda Karya, 2003), 13th Cet., p. 4-7.

<sup>15</sup> Hasanuddin AF., The Difference of Qira'at and Its Influence on Legal Istinbath in the Qur'an (Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada, 1995), p.79

'Uthman bin' Affan. 16 The rewriting of the Qur'an, according to Hasbi Ash-Shiddiegy, was initially motivated by the initiative of 'Umar bin Khattāb to Abū Bakr to collect the Qur'an.<sup>17</sup>

From the above understanding, it can be understood that Rasm 'utsmānī is a Qur'anic writing written by Zayd bin Tsabit and other companions approved by Caliph' Uthman bin' Affan. So the word 'utsmāni in the rasm is attributed to 'Uthman bin' Affān as a tribute. With this effort, 'Utsmān bin' Affan also means that he has laid the first foundation, which is called the knowledge of rasm al-Qur'an or the science of rasm 'utsmānī. 18

In the history of the writing of the Qur'an, there are two known rasm. Among them are rasm qiyasī and rasm istilahī. Rasm qiyasī is also called rasm imla'ī (scriptio defectiva), which is the description of pronunciation that uses hijaiyah letters, while still paying attention to the standardisation of ibtida' and waqaf on it. This rasm is still in pure Arabic writing that does not yet have a style. According to Taufik Adnan Amal, the form of rasm imla \( \bar{t}\) (defective scriptio) used to copy the Our'an at that time still opened up opportunities for a person to read the text of the holy book in a variety of ways. In addition to the non-existence of vowel signs, several different consonants in this script are denoted in the same symbols. The mistake of reading the text of the Our'an (tashīf) copied in this kind of script can, of course, be minimised or avoided if one has a strong memorisation tradition or at least has a high level of familiarity with the text of the holy book. 19

Meanwhile, rasm isţilāḥī (scriptio plena) can also be called rasm 'utsmānī, which is the spelling of the writings of Zayd bin Tsabit and other companions used to write muṣḥaf 'utsmānī. The spelling of rasm istilā $h\bar{i}$  (scriptio plena) is a spelling of the Arabic script that has undergone a process of refinement to the last stage. The process of refinement began with the imposition of diacritical dots by Abū Aswād al-Du'ālī. M. M. Al-A'zamī mentioned that there were some orientalists, such as Pastor Yusūf Sa'īd, as noted by al-Munaggid, a historian of the alphabet, the dotted system and diacritics, who stated that it was probably the Syrians who first developed the period system. Not only that, Izzat Hassan also noted that the diacritical dots inserted into Arabic texts influence Syriac texts. Syria is more advanced in the dots and grammar system, so that Arabic can borrow them freely. However, al-A'zamī asserts that the orientalists were mistaken, because for 600 years the Syrians wrote the gospels without periods; they only began to write periodicals at the end of the 7th century AD and the beginning of the 8th century AD. <sup>20</sup>

The writing of Rasm'utsmānī in the process of its completion undergoes five stages. In the first stage, no sign has been placed. The second stage is placed as a dot mark (nugtah al-i'rab), which is a syakl in the form of a dot pioneered by Abū Aswād al-Du'ālī (69 H). In the third stage, the letters began to be given a period (nuqtah al-i'jām), which is a dot on certain letters pioneered by Yaḥyā bin Ya'mar and Nasir bin' Asīm al-Lisī on the order of al-Hajjāj bin Yūsuf al-Tsaqāfī as the Governor of Iraq at that time. The fourth stage begins to lay the line mark (harakat), which al-Khalīl bin Ahmad al-Farāhidī pioneered during the reign of the 'Abbasids, namely 'Abd al-Mālik bin Marwan. The fifth stage has just been added with signs of waqaf and others.<sup>21</sup>

Apart from that, in the process of perfecting the texts of the Qur'an, rasm 'utsmānī is of course inseparable from the various official readings (lectio vugata) or girā'ah sab'ah that are transmitted orally from generation to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Manna' al-Qattan, Introduction to the Study of the Science of the Qur'an (Jakarta: Pustaka al-Kautsar, 2012), p. 150.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> M. Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy, History and Introduction to the Science of the Qur'an/Tafsir (Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1990),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Abdul Djalal, *Ulumul Qur'an*, p.29

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Taufik Adnan Amal, Reconstruction of the History of the Our'an, p. 311-312.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> M.M. al-A'zamī, The History of The Quranic Text: From Relevation to Compilation, (Jakarta: Gema Insani, 2005), h.158-165

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Ministry of Home Affairs Malaysia Control and Licensing Board for Printing of the Qur'an, Guide to Rasm 'Utsmānī (Kuala Lumpur: Secretariat, T.Th), p. 20

generation, starting from the mouth of the Prophet Saw himself who received revelation, so that the variety of readings has a divine authority that is separate from the written texts.<sup>22</sup>

From the above rasm, it can be concluded that rasm qiyāsī and rasm isṭilāḥī are the ancient Arabic writing culture that has existed and been known since the Prophet was alive and continued to develop until the last phase of the refinement of the text. So the writing of the two rasms above can be said to be the form of the old rasm and the new rasm in the treasure of Arabic script writing with all changes, both additions and subtractions in the tradition of the text, but this does not change the meaning and content of the Qur'an in the slightest.

# The Rules of Rasm' Utsmānī on the Mushaf of the Qur'an

In the process of improving and perfecting the Rasm 'utsmānī text, of course, the initiators have rules or methods to standardise the reading of the Qur'an. The rules in the text of Rasm 'utsmānī are as follows:

Al-Ḥazf (الخذف)), i.e. removing the letters from the sentence structure. The letters that were removed were alif (ا), ya ,(ع) waw (ع), lam (الخذف), lam (ن).

Examples of *alif* () that are omitted in sentences:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Al-Fatiḥaḥ [1]: 1	بِسْمِ اللهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيْمِ	باسم الله الرحمن الرحيم
Āli 'Imrān [3]: 96	وَهُدًى لِلْعَلَمِيْنَ	وهدى ل العالمين
Al-Baqarah [2]: 21	يَآيُّهَا النَّاسُ	ياأيها الناس

Example of yes  $(\varsigma)$  that is omitted in a sentence:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Āli 'Imrān [3]: 175	وَحَافُوْنِ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ مُؤْمِنِيْنَ	وخافوني
Hud [11]: 105	يَوْمَ يَأْتِ لَايَتَكَلَّمُ	يأتي
Al-Fajr [89]: 4	وَالَّيْلِ إِذَا يَسْرِ	يسري

Examples of waw (3) omitted in sentences:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Al-Ṣāffāt [37]: 105	صَدَّقْتَ الرُّءْيَآ	الروءيا
Al-'Alaq [96]: 18	سَنَدْعُ الزَّبَانِيَةَ	سندعو
Al-Qamar [54]: 6	يَدْعُ الدَّاعِ إِلَى	يدعو

Example of  $lam(\mathcal{O})$  omitted in a sentence:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Al-Baqarah [2]: 4	الَّذِينَ	اللذين
Al-Baqarah [2]: 22	الَّذِي	اللذي
Al-Baqarah [2]: 143	الَّتِي	اللتي

Example of a nun (i) that is omitted in a sentence:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Yusuf [12]: 11	لَاتَأْمَنَّا	تأمننا

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Taufik Adnan Amal, Reconstruction of the History of the Qur'an, p. 315

Al-Anbiyā' [21]: 88	ڔٞ۠ڹ۠	:
711 7111biya [21]: 00	ــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــــ	تنجى

Example of Al-Ḥazf at the beginning of the surah (فواتح السور):

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Maryam [19]: 1	كَهٰلِعۡصَ ۚ	كاف ها يا عين صاد
Qāf [50]: 1	قَ ۗ	قاف
Ṣād [38]: 1	صن ق	صاد

Al-Ziyādah (الزيادة), i.e. adding or establishing a letter that does not function or is not read when waṣal or waqaf in a sentence. The letters added are alif (1), ya (2) waw (3), which are then marked with breadfruit ().

Example of adding *alif* () in a sentence:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Al-Dukhān [44]: 15	إِنَّا كَاشِفُواْالْعَذَابِ	كاشفو
Yūsuf [12]: 87	وَلَا <u>تَاْيْئَسُواْ</u> مِنْ رَوْحِ	تيئسو
Al-Anfāl [8]: 66	مِاْئَةٌ صَابِرَةٌ	ä£o

Example of adding waw (ع) to a sentence:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Al-Baqarah [2]: 5	أُوْلَئِكَ	ألائك
Al-Anfāl [8]: 75	وَأُوْلُواْلْأَرْحَامِ	الوا
Al-A'rāf [7]: 145	سَأُوْرِيْكُمْ دَارَ	ساريكم

Example of adding *yes* (2) to a sentence:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Al-An'ām [6]: 34	مِن نَّبَإِي الْمُرْسَلِيْنَ	نبإ
Al-Anbiya' [21]: 34	أَفَإِيْنِ مِّتَّ	أفإن
Āli 'Imrān [3]: 144	أَفَإِيْنِ مَّاتَّ أَوْقَتِلَ	أفإن

Hamzah (همزة وصل), there are two hamzah writings in rasm 'utsmānī, namely hamzah waṣal (همزة وصل) and hamzah qata' (هنزة قطع). Hamzah waṢal is written with the letter alif on which is harakat Ṣad (ص). At the same time, Hamzah Qata' is written with the original letter Hamzah (\*). Example:

Surah and Verses	Example	Types of Hamzah
Al-Fatiḥah [1]: 2	ٱلْحَمْدُ لِلهِ رَبِّ الْعَلَمِيْنُ	Hamzah Wa <b>ṣ</b> al (وصل)
Maryam [19]: 38	وَأَبْصِرْ	Hamzah Qata' (قطع

In addition to the two hamzahs, some hamzahs are breadfruit (dead) and hamzahs who gather. Hamzah breadfruit can be in the form of hamzah, in the form of alif, waw, and yes. Examples are as follows:

Surah and Verses	Example	Hamzah's Form
Al-Wāqi'ah [56]: 75	ٲؙنۺؗٲ۠ؿؙ	Alif
Al-Ḥijr [15]: 49	نبِّئ	Ya
Āli 'Imrān [3]: 110	وَتُؤْمِنُوْنَ	Waw

While examples of the types of *hamzah* that gather are as follows:

Surah and Verses	Example	Hamzah's Form
Āli 'Imrān [3]: 15	<u>ٲ</u> ٷؙڹڽؚؖڣٛػؙؠۨ	Hamzah and Hamzah Waw
Al-Ṣāffāt [37]: 86	أَيْفٌكًا _	Hamzah and Hamzah Ya
Al-Baqarah [2]: 6	ءَأَنْذَرْهًمْ	Hamzah and Hamzah Alif

Al-Badal (البدل), i.e. replacing letters with other letters. The replacement of these letters includes: Replacing alif with waw, replacing alif with ya, replacing nun with alif, replacing ta' marbūṭah with ta' maftūḥah, 23 And replacing waw tsulāsi with alif. One example is as follows:

Surah and Verses	Rasm' Utsmānī	Original Spelling/Rasm Imlā'ī
Entirely	اَلصَّلُوةَ	الصلاة
Āli 'Imrān [3]: 73	اَهْدَى	الهدا
Al-Nisā' [4]: 53	فَإِذًا لَا يُؤْتُونَ	فإذن
Al-Baqarah [2]: 231	يَرْجُوْنَ رَحْمَتِ اللهِ	رحمة
Entirely	الصَّلُوةَ	الصلاة
Al-Taubah [9]: 109	شَفَا	شفو

**Al-Waṣal wa al-Faṣal,** which is connecting and separating the words in the Qur'an. The examples of al-waṣal are as follows:

Surah and Verses	Example	Al-Wașal
'Abasa [80]: 5	أُمَّامَنِ اسْتَغْنَى	ما withأم
Al-A'rāf [7]: 37	مِمَّنِ افْتَرَى عَلَى اللهِ	مَنْ withمِنْ
Al-Ghāsyiah [88]: 8	ۇجُوْهٌ <u>يَوْمَئِذٍ</u> نَّاعِمَةٌ	إذ withيوم

While the example of al-fasal is as follows:

Surah and Verses	Example	Al-Fașal
Al-An'ām [6]: 131	ذَلِكَ أَنْ لَمْ بَكُنْ رَبُّكَ	لًا with أَنْ
Al-Najm [53]: 29	عَنْ مَنْ تَوَكَّى عَنْ ذِكْرِنَا	مَنْ withعَنْ
Al-Ṣāffāt [37]: 130	سَلَمٌ عَلَى إِ <u>ل</u> ْ يَاسِيْنَ	يَاسِيْنَ withإِلْ

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> The replacement of ta' marbūṭah with ta' maftūḥah in the Qur'an only occurs in some sentences. This gives the impression that there is indeed a secret in the replacement of the letters.

# Sentences That Have Two Readings. Examples are:24

Sentences/Verses	Explanation
مَلِكِ	Mim is read long and short.
Al-Fatiḥah [1]: 4	171111 15 Tead 1011g and 51101t.
صِرَطَ	Reads Ṣad (ܩܩ), sin (ܩ७), and isymam
Al-Fatiḥah [1]: 7	zay (like the voice of al-zay)
وَيَبْصُطُ	It is <i>pronounced Ṣad</i> (ص) and <i>sin</i> (س).
Al-Baqarah [2]: 245	10 15 pronouncia șau (52) and sin (52).

# The Controversy of the Application of Rasm 'Utsmānī in Mushaf Writing

The introduction of Rasm' utsmānī, which had been perfected in the writing of the Our'an, reaped acute controversy among Muslim scholars. Most Muslim scholars believe that rasm 'utsmānī – the form of writing used in 'Uthman's time to copy the Qur'an – is not subject to the rules compiled by the ingenuity of human reason. According to this view, the Rasm is derived from the Prophet (tawqīfī) and is recognised as one of the Muslim community's sacred and inviolable traditions (sunnah). Muslims are obliged to obey it in any situation.<sup>25</sup> Among the Muslim scholars who agree with the above opinion are Imam Ibn al-Mubārak, Abū' Amr al-Dānī, Imam Mālik bin Anas, and Ahmad bin Hanbal (d.855).

One of Ibn al-Mubārak's reasons for his opinion is that rasm 'utsmānī has power and secrets hidden behind his writings.<sup>26</sup> Agreeing with Ibn al-Mubārak's opinion above, Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūtī gives an example that the writing of the letter ya'in a sentence (بأييد), contains the secret that the power of Allah SWT is different from the power of man. So adding the letter ya' to the sentence is a tribute to Him.<sup>27</sup> Abū' Amr al-Dānī refers to Imam Sakhāwī's opinion that writing the Qur'an with another model is an act of ignorance of the virtues inscribed by the scholars of the first period (companions).<sup>28</sup> Then Imam Mālik, when asked about the ruling of writing the Qur'an with rasm istilāhī (scriptio plena), he also emphasised that "it must be written according to the first writing". It is further strengthened by the opinion of Ahmad bin Hanbal, who stated that it is unlawful to violate the writing of 'utsmānī, such as in the case of writing waw, ya, alif, or others.<sup>29</sup>

Meanwhile, one of the scholars who considers that rasm 'utsmānī is not tawqīfī is Abū Bakr al-Baqillānī (d.403). He emphasised that neither the Qur'an nor the hadith required a particular way of writing the muṣḥaf, and therefore the writer of the Qur'an was free to use any form of writing. Similarly, no consensus of the ummah (ijma') requires it. Furthermore, al-Baqillānī affirms the ability of mushaf to write in various ways, both with ancient writing and spelling and with new writing and spelling, because writing is only symbols that function as signals, symbols, and formulas used to facilitate reading. al-Baqillānī's view has a reasonably wide resonance to this day. 30 Hasbi ash-Shiddiegy considers the idea of al-Baqillānī worthy of being held. The arguments are real, and the reviews are

h.451

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Ministry of Home Affairs Malaysia Control and Licensing Board for Printing of the Qur'an, Guide to Rasm 'Utsmānī, p. 29-56

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Taufik Adnan Amal, Reconstruction of the History of the Qur'an, p. 325

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Subhi al-Şālih, Mabāhits fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmī, 1997), h. 276

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūtī, Al-Itgān fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān (Beirut: Muassasah al-Kutub al-Tsaqafah, 1996), h. 448

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Muhammad 'Abd al-'Azīm Al-Zarqānī, *Manāhil al-Irfān fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān* (Kairo: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmī, T.Th),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Taufik Adnan Amal, Reconstruction of the History of the Our'an, p. 325

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Taufik Adnan Amal, Reconstruction of the History of the Our'an, p. 325-326

far-fetched. He even believes that the person who views racism as having Divine sanction (tanqifi) is a person who is devoted to feelings.<sup>31</sup>

In addition, there is an assumption that the rasm' utsmānī project initiated by the third caliph, according to Regis Blachere was a political project involving the Quraysh aristocracy including Zaid bin Tsabit, Sa'id bin Ass, Abdullah bin Zubair, and Abdurrahman bin Haris who were appointed as the Sttering Committee. Meanwhile, Abdullah bin Amr, Abdullah bin Abbas, Abdullah bin Umar, Malik bin Amir, Anas bin Malik, Katsir bin Aflah, Ubay bin Ka'ab, and Nafi' bin Zubair are the members of the Organising Committee, even though in reality it is not proven, because all of them are returned to the Quraysh dialect.<sup>32</sup>

From the debate between the two opinions above, it can be understood that the Rasm' utsmānī, which was completed at the end of the 3rd century H/9 AD, was a product of human culture that developed in harmony with human development. Therefore, the opinion that considers that the writing of Rasm' utsmānī is tawqīfī is an attempt to sacrosanctize the product of human culture. Finally, this perfected rasm 'utsmānī (scriptio plena) is used entirely in copying the Qur'an to the present day. Therefore, choosing the use of Qur'an writing that is easy to understand is the right choice to avoid mistakes in reading the Qur'an.

Table 1. Pros and Cons of the Opinions of Scholars on the Writing of Rasm' Utsmānī on the Mushaf of the Qur'an

Scholars/Figures	Pro-Rasm Utsmānī	Counter-Rasm in Utsmani
Ibn al-Mubārak	Utsmānī rasm is derived from the	
	Prophet (tawqīfī), and is recognised as	
	one of the sacred and inviolable	
	traditions (sunnah) of the Muslim	
	community. Muslims are obliged to	
	obey it in any situation.	
Jalāl al-Dīn al-	Rasim' Uthmmānī had power and	
Şuyūţī	secrets hidden behind his writings.	
Abū 'Amr al-Dānī	Writing the Qur'an with a model	
dan Imam	other than Rasim' utsmānī is an act of	
Sakhāwī	disobedience to the virtues inscribed	
	by the scholars of the first period	
	(Companions).	
Imam Mālik bin	The Qur'an should follow the first	
Anas	writing (rasm' utsmānī).	
Aḥmad bin	It is unlawful to violate <i>the writing of the</i>	
Hanbal	rasm' utsmānī, as in the case of writing	
	waw, ya', alif, or others.	
Abū Bakr al-		rasm 'utsmānī is not tawqīfī. Because the
Baqillānī		Qur'an and hadith do not require a
		specific method for writing the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Taufik Adnan Amal, Reconstruction of the History of the Our'an, p. 330

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Abdul Hafizdkk, Arrazy Hasyim, and M. Ziyad Ulhaq, "The Intervention of the Quraysh Ethnic-Aristocracy in the Codification of rasm 'utsmānī (A Critical Study of Hostorist Analysis of the Book Introduction Au Quran)", Al-Tadabbur: Journal of the Science of the Qur'an and Tafsir, Tt.Tv. p. 14.

	muṣḥaf, the Qur'an is free to use any form. Similarly, no consensus of the ummah (ijma') requires it. Therefore, it is permissible to write muṣḥaf in various ways, either with ancient writing and spelling or with new writing and spelling, because writing is only symbols that function as signals, symbols, and formulas to facilitate reading.
Hasbi ash- Shiddieqy	The person who views <i>rasm' utsmānī</i> as having Divine sanction ( <i>tawqīfī</i> ) is the one who is tahkim to feelings.
Regis Blachere	The rasm' utsmānī was a political project involving the Quraysh aristocracy including Zaid bin Tsabit, Sa'id bin Ass, Abdullah bin Zubair, and Abdurrahman bin Haris who were appointed as the Sttering Committee. Meanwhile, Abdullah bin Amr, Abdullah bin Abbas, Abdullah bin Umar, Malik bin Amir, Anas bin Malik, Katsir bin Aflah, Ubay bin Ka'ab, and Nafi' bin Zubair are the members of the Organising Committee, even though in reality it is not proven, because all of them are returned to the Quraysh dialect.

## Argumentation of the Policy of Writing the Mushaf al-Qur'an with Rasm' Utsmānī

The policy of writing rasm 'utsmānī in the Qur'anic mushaf has become a topic of attention, especially regarding its accuracy, authenticity, and relevance for the modern generation. This policy refers to a historical decision made during the time of Caliph' Uthman bin' Affān, where specific writing standards for the Qur'anic mushaf were established. The primary purpose of documenting the Rasm' utsmānī was to unify how the Qur'an was written and pronounced throughout the wider Islamic region of the time, to avoid differences that could cause disputes among the ummah. The main argument underlying this policy is to preserve the text of the Qur'an in its original form, as revealed to the Prophet Muhammad PBUH.33

The decision of the Caliph' Uthman on this writing was not taken unilaterally; it involved several trusted companions in memorisation and writing of revelations, including Zaid bin Tsabit. The standard mushaf was then copied and distributed to various regions, and other mushafs that did not conform to this standard were asked to be destroyed. This step is a form of effort to maintain the purity and authenticity of the Qur'an from possible differences and changes. In this context, rasm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Fathul Amin, "The Ottoman Rasm Rules in the Indonesian Qur'an Mushaf as a Source of Learning to Read and Write the Qur'an," in Tadris: Journal of Islamic Education Research and Thought 14, no. 1 (2020), https://doi.org/10.51675/jt.v14i1.73.

'utsmānī is seen not as just a writing system, but as an integral part of efforts to maintain the purity of the Qur'anic text.34

Historically, rasm' utsmānī has been maintained as a form of Muslims' commitment to the purity of divine revelation. Many scholars view Rasm' utsmānī as closely related to the tradition of revelation that the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) conveys to the companions. Maintaining writing in this Rasm style is considered a form of respect and commitment to the tradition of revelation taught by the Prophet. Those who support this policy argue that changes or adaptations to the form of writing of the Qur'an can be considered damaging to the sacred and historical value of the mushaf.<sup>35</sup>

However, few scholars are aware of the challenges that arise with changing times. They realised that Rasm' utsmānī used spelling and writing styles that may not always be easy for modern readers to understand. For example, some forms of writing in Rasm' utsmānī have unique writing of letters different from modern Arabic. This is often a difficulty for readers new to learning the Qur'an or with no Arabic background, so questions arise about adapting the writing.<sup>36</sup>

Nevertheless, most scholars consider that maintaining the rasm 'utsmānī is still preferable because it guarantees the integrity and uniformity of the text. They are worried that modifications in writing could be the beginning of other changes that may occur in the future. Therefore, to bridge this challenge, they suggest that the study of the Qur'an be accompanied by a teaching method that aids in the understanding of rasm' utsmānī, for example, through Our'anic reading guides that explain specific spellings, or through the addition of punctuation marks that make it easier for readers.<sup>37</sup>

On the other hand, scholars who support adaptation or modification in the writing of the Qur'an argue that the primary purpose of the Qur'an is as a guide for life for humanity. They say that if the current form of writing is too difficult to understand, then steps need to be taken so that Muslims can more easily access the message of the Qur'an in various parts of the world. However, they also agreed that the changes should be made with great caution and still refer to the scientific principles in studying the Qur'an.<sup>38</sup>

To quell this controversy, some Islamic institutions are trying to find a compromise solution, for example, by adding footnotes or reading guides to the mushaf that uses rasm' utsmānī so that the reader can understand the meaning of each form of writing. Another solution is to develop an Islamic education curriculum that facilitates special learning about rasm' utsmānī, so that Muslims can read and understand the Qur'an correctly while respecting its historical heritage.<sup>39</sup>

Some countries, including Indonesia, maintain the use of rasm' utsmānī in the Our'anic mushaf, but with some technical adjustments in punctuation to make it easier to understand. Institutions such as Lajnah Pentashihan Mushaf al-Qur'an in Indonesia even have a special policy to ensure that the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Misnawati Misnawati, "The Rule of Al Hazf in Rasm Utsmānī," Al-Mu'ashirah Scientific Journal 18, no. 1 (2021): 83, https://doi.org/10.22373/jim.v18i1.10554.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Zaenal Arifin Madzkur, "The Urgency of the Ottoman Rasm (Portrait of the History and Law of Writing the Qur'an with the Ottoman Rasm)," in Jurnal Khatulistiwa-Journal Of Islamic Studies 1, no. 1 (2011): 15-24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> A Muhaimin Zen, "The Problem of Writing the Qur'an Mushaf with the Ottoman Rasp: An Analysis of the Views of Sheikh Muhammad Thahir Bin Abdul Qadir Al-Kurdi," in Mumtaz: Journal of Qur'an and Islamic Studies 1, no. 2 (2019): 159–72, https://doi.org/10.36671/mumtaz.v1i2.16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Solihun Wildan et al., "The Rule of the Ottoman Rasm and Its Correlation with Qiroah Sab'ah," Al Irfani Journal of the Knowledge of the Qur'an and Tafsir 3, no. 2 (2022), https://doi.org/10.51700/irfani.v3i2.385.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Abdul Basid, "The Contribution of the Ottoman Rasm Writing Rules in the Study of the Qur'an," *International* Conference For Calligraphy 1, no. 1 (2021): 82–96, https://prosiding.arab-um.com/index.php/iccal/article/view/1122.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Mustika Hadiyatun, Kholil Nawawi, and Ibdalsyah Ibdalsyah, "The Influence of the Ottoman Rasm Method on the Fluency and Comprehension of Reading the Qur'an," in As-Syar'i: Journal of Family Guidance & Counseling 4, no. 2 (2021): 147–57, https://doi.org/10.47467/as.v4i2.820.

printed mushaf is by the rules of rasm' utsmānī, but still pay attention to the needs of readers in Indonesia who may have limitations in reading classical Arabic texts.<sup>40</sup>

This policy is not only a technical decision but also a reflection of Muslims' commitment to keeping the Qur'an in its authentic form. Through the application of racism 'utsmānī, Muslims are expected to have a strong attachment to the Qur'an's early history and an awareness of the importance of maintaining the legacy passed down by the Prophet Muhammad SAW.<sup>41</sup>

Thus, the policy of writing rasm' utsmānī in the mushaf of the Qur'an does not only concern the technical aspects of writing, but also reflects an attitude of respect for the tradition, history, and sacred values of the Qur'an. This policy is taken to maintain the authenticity and uniqueness of the Qur'an as a holy book, as well as provide space for Muslims to understand the content of the Qur'an through supportive learning methods.

#### Conclusion

From the above explanation, it can be concluded that rasm 'utsmānī is a Qur'an written in a special method by Zayd bin Tsabit together with several other companions, such as Ubay bin Ka'ab, 'Alī bin Abī Tālib, and it was agreed upon by 'Uthman bin' Affān as the Caliph, who then underwent the process of perfecting the text until the final stage. The rules used in rasm' utsmānī include al-hazf (discarding letters), al-ziyādah (adding letters), hamzah, al-badal (adding letters), al-wasal wa al-fasal, and the rules of writing sentences which have two readings. The law of writing Rasm utsmānī in writing mushaf is not forbidden, because writing is a product of human culture. However, it should also be understood that the writing of the Qur'an aims to avoid mistakes in the reading of the Qur'an (tashīt).

## **Bibliography**

AF, Hasanuddin. The Difference of Qira'at and Its Influence on the Legal Istinbath in the Qur'an. Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada, 1995.

Al-A'zamī, M.M. The History of The Quranic Text: From Revelation to Compilation, Jakarta: Gema Insani, 2005.

Amal, Taufik Adnan. Reconstruction of the History of the Our'an. Jakarta: Pustaka Alvabet, 2005.

Ansori, Muhammad. "Political Authority in the Codification of Mushaf during the Time of the Caliph al Rasidin", Ushuluddin Science, Vol. 18, no. 2, July-December 2019.

Anwar, Rosihon. Introduction to the Qur'an. Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 2009.

Ash-Shiddiegy, M. Hasbi. History and Introduction to the Science of the Qur'an/Tafsir. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1990.

Basid, Abdul. "The Contribution of the Ottoman Rasm Writing Rules in the Study of the Qur'an." International Conference for Calligraphy 1, no. 1 (2021): 82-96. https://prosiding.arab-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Khairul Muttaqin and Jamal Abd. Nasir, "Ottoman Rasm in the Indonesian Qur'an in the Amor Youth Group (Arek Mor Lorong) of Lenteng Sumenep District," in PERDIKAN (Journal of Community Engagement) 1, no. 2 (2019), https://doi.org/10.19105/pjce.v1i2.2506.

<sup>41</sup> Abd Muid N, Muhaemin B, and Ahmad Samir Al-Kannash, ":Ras-e-Ma'm-mu'ta'i wa'da'ab al-ta'ahu Darasa'i Magarna'i bin Mushaaf al-Madinah al-Munawari wa Wa Munafi Minarah Quddus-Indonesia," in Muntaz: Journal of Quran and Islamic Studies 5, no. 02 (2022): 201-14, https://doi.org/10.36671/mumtaz.v5i02.212.

- um.com/index.php/iccal/article/view/1122.
- Djalal, Abdul. *Ulumul Qur'an*. Surabaya: World of Science, 2000.
- Fathul Amin. "The Ottoman Rasm Rules in the Indonesian Qur'an Mushaf as a Source of Learning to Read and Write the Qur'an." Tadris: Journal of Islamic Education Research and Thought 14, no. 1 (2020). https://doi.org/10.51675/jt.v14i1.73.
- Ghazali, Abd Moqsith, et al., Methodology of Qur'an Study. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2009.
- Hafizdkk, Abdul. Hasyim, Arrazy and Ulhaq, M. Ziyad. "The Intervention of the Quraysh Ethnic-Aristocracy in the Codification of rasm 'utsmānī (A Critical Study of Hostorist Analysis of the Book Introduction Au Quran)", Al-Tadabbur: Journal of the Science of the Our'an and Tassir, Tt.
- Hadiyatun, Mustika, Kholil Nawawi, and Ibdalsyah Ibdalsyah. "The Influence of the Ottoman Rasm Method on the Fluency and Comprehension of Reading the Qur'an." As-Syar'i: Journal of Family Guidance & Counselling 4, no. 2 (2021): 147–57. https://doi.org/10.47467/as.v4i2.820.
- Judge Abdul. "Methods of Studying Rasm, Qiroaat, Waqf and dabt in Ancient Mushaf" Journal of Suhuf Ministry of Religion, Volume 11, No. 1, June 2018.
- Lasmana, Nunung. "Symbolic Phenomenology of the Qur'an: Epistemological Criticism of the Introductory Book of Phenomenology of the Qur'an Scientific Dimension Behind the Ottoman Mushaf', Oof Journal, Volume 1, Number 2, July 2017.
- Control and Licensing Board for the Printing of the Qur'an, Ministry of Home Affairs, Malaysia, Guide to Rasm' Utsmānī. Kuala Lumpur: Secretariat, T.Th.
- Lubis, Armany et al., History of Islamic Civilization. Jakarta: Center for Women's Studies (PSW) UIN Jakarta, 2005.
- Madzkur, Zaenal Arifin. "The Urgency of the Ottoman Rasm (Portrait of the History and Law of Writing the Qur'an with the Ottoman Rasm)." Equatorial Journal Of Islamic Studies 1, no. 1 (2011): 15–24.
- Misnawati, Misnawati. "Rule of Al Hazf in Rasm Utsmānī." Al-Mu'ashirah Scientific Journal 18, no. 1 (2021): 83. https://doi.org/10.22373/jim.v18i1.10554.
- Moleong, Lexy J. Qualitative Research Methodology. Bandung: Rosda Karya, 2003.
- Muttaqin, Khairul, and Jamal Abd. Nasir. "Ottoman Rasm in the Indonesian Qur'an in the Amor Youth Group (Arek Mor Lorong) Lenteng Sumenep District." Journal of Community Engagement 1, no. 2 (2019). https://doi.org/10.19105/pice.v1i2.2506.
- N, Abd Muid, Muhaemin B, and Ahmad Samir Al-Kannash. "Drawing and Controlling the Our'an A Comparative Study between the :Qur'an of Medina and the Qur'an of the Lighthouse of Quds-Indonesia." Mumtaz: Jurnal Studi Al-Quran Dan Keislaman 5, no. 02 (2022): 201–14. https://doi.org/10.36671/mumtaz.v5i02.212.
- Thanks, Eva. The Concept of the Prophet al-Ummi and Its Implications on the Writing of Rasm, Journal of Reflection Volume 13, Number 2, April 2012.
- Al-Qattan, Manna'. Introduction to the Study of Qur'anic Science. Jakarta: Pustaka al-Kautsar, 2012.
- Al-Ṣālih, Ṣubḥi. Mabāḥits fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmī, 1997.
- Al-Sālih, Subhi. Discussing the Sciences of the Qur'an, Translator: Paradise Library Team. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1993.

- Al-Suyūtī, Jalāl al-Dīn. Al-Itgān fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān. Beirut: Muassasah al-Kutub al-Tsaqafah, 1996.
- Tadjab, et al. Dimensions of Islamic Studies. Surabaya: Karya Abditama, 1994.
- Wildan, Solihun, Indana Zulfa Muntafiah, Ratna Eka Septiana, and Nur Wakhid. "The Rules of the Ottoman Rasm and Its Correlation with Qiroah Sab'ah." Journal of Al Irfani Ilmu Al Qur'an and Tafsir 3, no. 2 (2022). https://doi.org/10.51700/irfani.v3i2.385.
- Zaman, Akhmad Roja Badrus. "Rasm al-Usmani among Santri (Study of Qur'an Reception at Al-Hidayah Islamic Boarding School Karangsuci Purwokerto)" Raushan Fikr, Vol. 7 No. 1 January 2018.
- Al-Zarqānī, Muḥammad 'Abd al-'Azīm. Manāhil al-Irfān fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān. Kairo: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmī, T.Th.
- Zen, A Muhaimin. "The Problem of Writing the Mushaf of the Qur'an with the Ottoman Rasm: An Analysis of the Views of Sheikh Muhammad Thahir bin Abdul Qadir Al-Kurdi." Mumtaz: Our'an and Islamic Studies 1, no. (2019): 159–72. https://doi.org/10.36671/mumtaz.v1i2.16.