

A Debate on the Islamic Practice of Pilgrimage to the Grave: Study of the Hadīth on Grave Pilgrimage for Women

Kamarudin¹, Sabil Mokodenseho²

¹Universitas Islam Negeri (UIN) Datokrama Palu, Indonesia

²Sekolah Pascasarjana Universitas Islam Negeri (UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia

Correspondence: sabil.mokodenseho@gmail.com

DOI: 10.29240/alquds.v6i2.4390

Submitted: 2022-04-13 | Revised: 2022-06-27 | Accepted: 2022-07-21

Abstract: This research aimed to analyze the hadīths and comments of 'ulamā' regarding the prohibition and permissibility of grave visitation by women. In the time of the Prophet Muhammad, the practice of visiting graves was strictly prohibited but later the prohibition was abolished. However, after the Prophet's death, the pros and cons surrounding the law on grave pilgrimage resulted in hostility, as the performers were accused of grave worship and convicted of heresy. Subsequently, the data were analyzed using the library research method with a comparative-compromising approach. The results showed that hadīths on the law of pilgrimage for women were not singular and had birthed several other laws. The admonishment of grave visitation by hadīths editors did not apply to all women because many supported pilgrimages, which made such curses *nasākh*. It denoted that hadīths prohibiting women from visiting graves were no longer valid, except for the *'illāt*, which fulfilled the curse of women. Since different editorials will give rise to varying opinions regarding the grave pilgrimage for women, a compromise between hadīths is necessary to produce an accurate and accommodating legal formulation.

Keywords: Hadīth; Law; Woman; Grave Pilgrimage; *Nasākh-Mansūkh*; Comparative-Compromising

Introduction

Pilgrimage or "visit"¹ is a universally popular activity that encompasses all places of honor, such as the graves and shrines of saints, trees, wells, and stones, but lacks the authority of the Qur'ān. The term 'pilgrimage' specifically refers to grave visitation (*ziyarat al-qubūr*), which is recorded in the Prophet's hadīth.²

The practice of grave pilgrimage was strictly prohibited by Prophet Muhammad but was later permitted.³ According to Mustafa Shalabi, this change was due to the level of religious literacy during the prohibition and permission period.⁴ Grave visitation was initially forbidden because the Prophet's companions were still new to Islam, and had little faith and creed. Their Islamic lives still involved *jāhiliyyah*, namely statue and idol worship, as even the surrounding Jews made the Prophet's tomb a shrine.⁵ Following the change in circumstances, the belief and faith of the companions strengthened, all forms of statues and idols destroyed, the rule of law was repealed, and grave visits were promoted.⁶

However, the above controversies remain unclear among the people, particularly Muslims. After the Prophet's death, pros and cons surrounding the law of grave pilgrimage frequently arise and lead to hostility. This is because pilgrims are often accused of grave worship and sentenced as shirks or heretics.⁷

¹ Mohd Idris, *Kamus Marbawi*, 1st & 2nd ed. (Kairo: Mustafa al-Halby, 1350), 272.

² Thomas Leisten, "Between Orthodoxy and Exegesis: Some Aspects of Attitudes in The Shari'a Toward Funerary Architecture," *Muqarnas Online* 7, no. 1 (1989): 12–22, <https://doi.org/10.1163/22118993-90000245>; Mustafa Kabha and Haggai Erlich, "Al-Ahbash and Wahhabiyya: Interpretations of Islam," *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 38, no. 4 (2006): 519–38, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4129146>.

³ Abdul Karim Zaydan, *Al-Madkhal Li Dirāsah Al-Shari'ah Al-Islamiyyah*, 13th ed. (Beirut: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1996), 96.

⁴ Muḥammad Mustafa Shalabi, *Al-Madkhal Fi Al-Ta'rif Bi Al-Fiqh Al-Islami* (Beirut: Dār al-Nahdah al-'Arabiyyah, 1985), 92.

⁵ Muḥammad bin Abdullah Al-Shawkani, *Nayl Al-Awtar*, "Kitab Al-Jana'iz": Bab Al-Nahy 'an Ittikhabh Al-Masajid Wa Al-Sarj Fi Al-Maqbarah (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1995), 98.

⁶ Muḥammad bin 'Isya bin Saurah Al-Tirmidzī, *Sunan Al-Tirmidzī*, "Kitab Al-Jana'iz": Bab Ma Ja'a Fi Al-Rukhsah Fi Ziyarah Al-Qubūr (Riyadh: Maktabah al-Ma'arif, 1996), 250.

⁷ Darsitun Darsitun, Khariri Khariri, and Darajat Darajat, "Women's Grave Perspective of Hadīth," *Journal of Hadīth Studies* 3, no. 1 (2020): 14–22, <https://doi.org/10.32506/johs.v3i1.545>; Ebenhaizer I. Nuban Timo, "The Tradition of Visiting the Graveyard: A Theological Study on the Ways of Timorese Christians Honoring and Remembering the Dead," in *Proceedings of the International Conference on Religion and Public Civilization (ICRPC 2018)* (Paris, France: Atlantis Press, 2019), 16–21, <https://doi.org/10.2991/icrpc-18.2019.4>; Leor Halevi, "Wailing for the Dead: The Role of Women in Early Islamic Funerals," *Past & Present*, no. 183 (2004): 3–39, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3600859>.

In fact, the destruction of the historical sites,⁸ including graves, constructed by Eng seng Ho in the contemporary Middle East, Yemen, was partly inspired by the practice of pilgrimage and rooted in disagreements over basic issues related to grave culture.⁹

Some 'ulamā' have rejected the authenticity of hadīths regarding the permissibility of pilgrimage, and its meanings have been interpreted in various ways. The beliefs and rituals associated with pilgrimage generally cause tension with the 'ulamā'. Also, fierce debates and divisions emerged immediately after the Islamic revival. This includes questions on the legality of building domes over graves, the permission of sayings, such as prayers and supplications at graves, and the propriety of praying directly to the dead. Other activities that created doubt include seeking intercession on behalf of oneself or others, permitting physical contact with the grave, and the maximum height at which graves can be erected without becoming idols.¹⁰

The prohibition of grave visitation by 'ulamā'¹¹ was proposed by one of the most famous medieval Islamic jurists and theologians, ibn Taīmīyyah (d. 728 AH), whose influence is still felt in Sunni discourses.¹² He categorized grave worshipers as people misled by Satan just as the Arab polytheists.¹³ This opinion led to his imprisonment for a legal opinion, which reportedly involved denouncing pilgrimage to the Prophet's tomb.¹⁴

Ibn Taīmīyyah (d. 728 AH) was defeated by his opponents, the Egyptian and Syrian 'ulamā', and died with his condemnation of grave pilgrimage and intercession in prison. Despite his failure to win in his lifetime, the scholar left an influential legacy for subsequent generations, who still felt compelled to engage in similar debates, either refuting or defending his arguments. His spiritual legacy, perhaps oversimplified and of debatable justification, has been adopted by

⁸ See, for example, an article by one of the most vocal opponents of the destruction of sites-historical sites: Irfan Al-Alawi, "The Destruction of Holy Sites in Mecca and Medina," *Islamica Magazine*, 2006.

⁹ See, Eng seng Ho, *The Graves of Tarim: Genealogy and Mobility across the Indian Ocean* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006). 5-7.

¹⁰ Ondrej Beranak and Pavel Tupek, "From Visiting Graves to Their Destruction: The Question of Ziyara Through the Eyes of Salafis," *Crown Papers*, 2009, 1-40.

¹¹ See, Mikkel Bille, "Dealing with Dead Saints," in *Taming Time, Timing Death: Social Technologies and Ritual*, ed. D. R. Christensen and R. Willerslev (Routledge Taylor & Francis Group, 2016), 137-55.

¹² Ibn Rajab, *Al-Dhayl 'ala Tabaqat Al-Hanabila*, IV (Riyadh: Maktabat al-'Ubaykan, 2005), 518.

¹³ Ibn Taīmīyyah, *Al-Radd 'ala Al-Mantiqīyyin*, I (Pakistan: Dār al-Tarjaman al-Sunnah, 1976), 105.

¹⁴ Rajab, *Al-Dhayl 'ala Tabaqat Al-Hanabila*, 518.

Muḥammad bin 'Abd al-Wahhāb (d. 1206 AH) as well as the current Salafis.¹⁵ According to 'Abd al-Wahhāb (d. 1206 AH), as quoted by al-Sa'dī (d. 1956 AD), the practice of grave visitation is prohibited because the worshipers may fear the dead person due to his dislike or anger towards them.¹⁶ Ibn al-Qayyīm (d. 751 AH) also shared the opinion that making the grave the most important and beloved place to Allah is damaging to faith.¹⁷

Additionally, Sheikh Abdul Aziz ibn Abdullah ibn Baz (d. 1999 AD), a former member of the Standing Committee (*al-Lajna al-Da'ima*) of Saudi Arabia, had a fatwa regarding the prohibition of the grave pilgrimage for men and women. The visitation of men to the graves of the Prophet and his companions was permitted, while touching, kissing, or surrounding it was forbidden. However, ibn Baz's fatwa contradicts the generally accepted belief, asserting that visiting the Prophet's grave is not obligatory for Muslims and is not a legal part of the Hajj.¹⁸ The visitation of women to the graves or attendance of funerals were considered forbidden by this fatwa due to their "impatient" nature and the tendency to cause temptation (*fitnah*).¹⁹ Regardless, pilgrims do not accept accusations of grave worship without a basis. They have a justification by adhering to the arguments for the recommendation of pilgrimage, which is one of the discussions in this research.

By adhering to their respective arguments and seeking justification from religious texts, one group considers itself right above the other (al-Qur'ān and al-Hadīth). Meanwhile, the implementation procedure, as well as women pilgrims, are the targets of cursed sentences.

Those who oppose the grave pilgrimage for women make hadīths with cursed editorials as justification for their beliefs. Conversely, some groups consider the practice part of a Muslim's travel traditions, comprising pilgrimage, *hijrah*, and *rihlah*.²⁰ These persons permit its performance, providing it does not lead to shirk or other offenses. Regular grave visitors and pilgrims view this practice as a form of *wasilah* in exalting their desires through the departed saints of Allah, who were known as knowledgeable and role models. They also imbibe

¹⁵ Beranak and Tupek, "From Visiting Graves to Their Destruction: The Question of Ziyara Through the Eyes of Salafis." 1-40.

¹⁶ Abdurrahman ibn Nashir Al-Sa'dī, *Al-Qawl as-Sadid 'ala Syarkeh Al-Ta'ubid*, I (Dār al-Tsabat, 2014), 120.

¹⁷ Ibn Al-Qayyīm, *Ighatsah Al-Labfan* (Jeddah: Majma'a al-Fiqh al-Islāmī, 1432 H), 198.

¹⁸ 'Abd al-'Aziz ibn 'Abdallah Ibn Baz, *Al-Tabqiq Wa Al-Idab Li-Katbir Min Masa'il Al-Hajj Wa Al-Umra Wa Al-Ziyara 'Ala Daw' Al-Kitab Wa Al-Sunna* (Mekah: Mu'assasat Makka lil-Tiba'a wa al-I'lam, 1974), 82.

¹⁹ 'Abd al-'Aziz ibn 'Abdallah Ibn Baz, *Al-Fatava Al-Mubimma* (Kairo: Dār al-Ghad al-Jadid, 2006), 473.

²⁰ Dale F. Eickelman and James P. Piscatori, eds., *Muslim Travellers: Pilgrimage, Migration, and the Religious Imagination*, IX (Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1990), xii.

lessons and warnings of remembering death, the future, and the hereafter in all their actions.²¹ Following this argument, the second group did not wish to lose and remained silent.

However, this issue must be addressed properly, without seeking justifications to strengthen each group's argument (*madḥab*) but by pursuing the truth by setting arrogance and fanaticism aside (*'Ashabiyah*). Attaining the truth requires precision and accuracy in parsing the arguments surrounding grave pilgrimage, particularly for women. This is because outwardly hadīth texts frequently seem contradictory (*ta'āruḍh*), allowing pilgrimage supporters and critics to find justification for their beliefs. Therefore, this topic should be addressed through a comprehensive investigation using a comparative-compromising approach (*al-muqaranah wa al-jam'u*). The comparative approach (*al-muqaranah*) is used to draw a conclusion by comparing ideas, opinions, and understandings in order to find out the similarities and differences in the objects of the study. Meanwhile, the compromise approach (*al-jam'u*), is used to compromise the hadīths that forbid and allow women to make pilgrimages to graves.

This research focused on hadīth editorials and statuses regarding the curse of grave pilgrimage for women and sought alternatives to these contradictions through hadīths permitting the practice, including the law according to the 'ulamā'.

Result and Discussion

The narration of Hadīths about the Curse of Grave Pilgrimage for Women

There are several hadith narrations relating to the curse of female grave visitors. They are present in the book *Al-Jāmi' al-Kabīr Sunan al-Tirmidzī*²² by Imām al-Tirmidzī (d. 279 AH), *Sunan ibn Mājah*²³ by Imām ibn Mājah (w. 273 AH), and *Musnad al-Imām Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal*²⁴ by Imām ibn Ḥanbal (w. 241 AH). The following is a description based on the origin of the *sanad*.

First, from Abū Hurāirah ra.:

إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ لَعَنَ زَائِرَاتِ الْقُبُورِ

²¹ Hariz Al-Farizi, *Rahasia Ziarah Kubur* (Jakarta: al-Sofwa Subur, 2003), 10.

²² Muḥammad bin 'Isya bin Saurah Al-Tirmidzī, *Al-Jāmi' Al-Kabīr Sunan Al-Tirmidzī*, II (Beirūt: Dār al-Gharby al-Islāmī, 1998), 362.

²³ Abū 'Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn Yazīd Ibn Mājah, *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, I (Dār Ihyā' al-Kutub al- 'Arabiyyah, n.d.), 502.

²⁴ Abū 'Abdillāh Aḥmad Ibn Muḥammad Ibn Ḥanbal, *Musnad Al-Imām Aḥmad Ibn Ḥanbal*, XIV (Kairo: Muasasatu al-Risālah, 2001), 164.

Verily, the Prophet SAW cursed the women who visited the graves.

The above hadīth was narrated by al-Tirmidzī and authenticated by ibn Ḥibbān al-Bustī (d. 354 AH)²⁵ and also conveyed by ibn Mājah (d. 273 AH) in *Sunan ibn Mājah*. According to Imām al-Tirmidzī, the status of this hadīth is *ḥasan*²⁶ or *ḥasan-shabīh* because of the many pathways of its description.

Second, from ibn Abbās ra.:

لَعَنَّ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ زَائِرَاتِ الْقُبُورِ وَالْمُتَّخِذِينَ عَلَيْهَا الْمَسَاجِدَ وَالسِّرَاجَ

Rasulullah SAW cursed the women who visited the graves and turned them into mosques and (lit) lanterns (lamps).

The above hadīth was narrated by an-Nasai, Abū Daūd, and ibn Mājah (d. 273 AH) in *al-Janaiz* Chapters (Hadīth Numbers 2039, 3236, and 1571, respectively), as well as al-Tirmidzī in the *Shalat* Chapter (Hadīth Number 320). The hadīth *sanad* was entirely from ibn Abbās (d. 68 AH), while *Musnad* by Imām Aḥmad was narrated from Yahya, Syu'bah (d. 160 AH), Muḥammad bin Jihadah, Abū Shaleh, and ibn Abbās. In addition, the description from Abū Daūd originated from Muḥammad bin Katsīr, Syu'bah bin al-Hajjaj (d. 160 AH), Muḥammad bin Jihadah, Abū Shaleh, and ibn Abbās.²⁷ However, ibn Ḥibbān al-Bustī (d. 354 AH) narrated another *sanad* from Abū Hurairah ra., recounted from Muḥammad bin Abdullah bin Junaid, Qutaibah bin Sa'id (w. 240 AH), Abū 'Awānah, Umar bin Abi Salamah, and from his father. The status of this hadīth is also *ḥasan*.

Third, from Abū Hurairah ra.:

أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ لَعَنَّ زَوَارَاتِ الْقُبُورِ

Verily, Rasulullah SAW cursed the women who frequently visited the graves.

This hadīth was narrated by ibn Mājah (d. 273 AH) Number 1641, 1642, 1643, al-Tirmidzī Number 1076, and Aḥmad Number 8904. Imām al-Tirmidzī recounted his narration from Qutaibah bin Sa'id (w. 240 AH), Abū 'Awānah, Umar bin Abi Salamah, his father, and Abū Hurairah ra. Imām al-Tirmidzī described the hadīth status as *ḥasan-shabīh* in his book.²⁸

²⁵ Ibn Hajar Al-‘Asqalānī, *Bulūgh Al-Marām* (Indonesia: Dār Ihyā’ al-Kutub al-‘Arabīyah, n.d.), 122.

²⁶ Ḥasan bin Ali al-Qanuji al-Bukhārī Al-Hindi, *Fath Al- ‘Allam Li Syarb Bulūgh Al-Marām*, I (Beirūt: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 1997).

²⁷ Abū Daūd Sulaiman bin al-Asy’ats Al-Sijastani, *Sunan Abū Daūd*, II (Beirūt: Dār al-Fīkr, 2011), 256.

²⁸ Muḥammad bin ‘Isya bin Saurah Al-Tirmidzī, *Sunan Al-Tirmidzī* (Riyadh: Maktabah al-Ma’arif li al-Nasyr wa al-Tawzi’, n.d.), 250.

Some books also used the editor:

أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ: لَعَنَ اللَّهُ زَوَارَاتِ الْقُبُورِ

*The Prophet of Allah (SAW) said: Allah has cursed the women who often visit the graves.*²⁹

This was utilized in al-'Asqalānī by al-Qurthūbī, which explained the meaning of the word 'curse' in the above hadīth, addressed to women who often visit the grave, as *lafazh* hadīth, *sighab mubalaghah*. It was also included in Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal's narration from two editorial sources, (1) *ḥunwārāt* and the history of Ḥassan by Abū Hurāirah ra., and (2) *lafazh ḥāirāt* from ibn Abbās (d. 68 AH).³⁰

Analysis of the Sanad Hadīths on the Curse of the Grave Pilgrimage

Some *sanad hadīths* concerning the curse of the grave pilgrimage were proposed by (1) Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal, al-Tirmidzī, and ibn Mājah (d. 273 AH), who narrated the hadīth prohibiting the pilgrimage of graves for women in three ways. This comprises the paths of Abū Salamah and Abū Shaleh from Abū Hurāirah and ibn Abbās (d. 68 AH), respectively, and Abdurrahmān bin Ḥassan's description from his father. (2) Abū Daūd. (3) Nasai. (4) The narration of Abū Daūd al-Tayalīsī (d. 204 AH) from ibn Abbās. (5) The description of ibn Ḥibbān al-Bustī (w. 354 AH) in his *shahīh* book from Abū Hurāirah and ibn Abbās, and (6) Al-Hākīm from Ḥassan ibn Tsābīt (d. 674 AD).³¹

The many paths of narration above can be broadly categorized into two. *First*, the description of ibn Abbās (d. 68 AH), where the truth about the name of the hadīth narrator, Abū Shaleh, is still debated among the 'ulamā'. Differences of opinion regarding Abū Shaleh's actual name have been condensed into two opinions. They are (1) Mizan al-Bashri Abū Shaleh, as stated by ibn Ḥibbān al-Bustī (d. 354 AH) in his *shahīh* book, and (2) Badzam, the slave of Ummu Hanī' or according to some, Badzan (*num*). This opinion was propagated by Imām al-Hākīm, Abdul Haq al-Isybīlī (d. 581 AH), ibn al-Qatthān, ibn 'Asakir, al-Mundzīr, ibn Dahīyah, and others.³²

²⁹ Mahmud bin Aḥmad Al-Aini, *Umdah Al-Qari Syarh Shahih Al-Bukhari*, VIII (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 2001), 100.

³⁰ Ibn Hajar Al-'Asqalānī, *Fath Al-Bari Syarh Shahih Al-Bukhari*, III (Kairo: Dār al-Bayan al-'Arabi, 2007), 174.

³¹ His full name is Abdurrahmān bin Ḥassan bin Mundzir bin Amr bin Haram al-Anshari. Ibn Ma'in mentions that he was one of the tabi'in and hadīth experts in Madinah. Ibn Sa'ad also mentioned that he was one of the few poets who narrated hadīths. However, Ibn Ḥibbān included it in his book *al-Tsiqat*. See *al-Tabdzīb* IV. 32.

³² See, Ibn Hajar Al-'Asqalānī, *Tabdzīb Al-Tabdzīb Fi Rijal Al-Hadits* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 2004), 391.

The narration of hadīth *la'ana zāirat al-qubūr* is still considered *shabīh*, where Abū Shaleh has two possible names, Mizan and Badzam. Regarding this argument, ibn Hatīm mentioned in *al-Jarab wa al-Ta'dil*, "It's not about him."³³ In fact, Sa'id, Zaidah, and Abdullāh bin 'Uthmān (d. 626 AD) did not leave (narrated from him). Similarly, Yahya ibn Ma'in stated, "There is no problem with Abū Shaleh, Umm Hani's slave since al-Kalbi narrated from him...."

Similar comments were made by the 'ulamā' hadīth concerning the credibility of Abū Shaleh, Umm Hani's slave. Aḥmad Syakir (d. 1309 AH) in his *Hāsyiah* in the book *Musnad Imām Aḥmad* stated "The truth (fact) is that Abū Shaleh, Umm Hani's slave is *tsiqah* (trustworthy). There is no argument for his slanderers (*dha'if*)...." from its sanad. According to Aḥmad Syakir (d. 1309 AH), hadīth *la'ana zāirat al-qubūr* includes *shabīh*. Also, al-Tirmidzī, al-Baghāwī (d. 516 AH), al-'Asqalānī (d. 852 AH), and Aḥmad Syakir (d. 1309 AH) in *Syarah al-Tirmidzī* view the status of the hadīth narrated by Qutaibah bin Sa'id (d. 240 AH) from 'Abd Warits bin Sa'id (d. 180 AH), Muḥammad bin Jihadah, Abī Shaleh, and ibn Abbās as *ḥasan*.

Second, Abū Hurairah ra., ibn Hibbān al-Bustī (d. 354 AH) conveyed, "Muḥammad bin Abdullah bin Junaid narrated to us from Qutaibah bin Sa'id (d. 240 AH), Abū 'Awānah, Umar ibn Abī Salamah, his father, and Abū Hurairah".³⁴ Umar ibn Salamah ibn Abdurrahman ibn 'Auf mentioned here is the Muslim brother. Abū Ḥatīm stated, "In my opinion, Umar was a pious and honest man, who wrote hadīths, with no evidence of erring." Ad-Dzahabi also declared "Imām al-Tirmidzī confirmed the hadīth *la'ana Rasulallah zuwwaraat al-qubūr* narrated by Umar." However, Abdul Haq al-Isybili (d. 581 AH) criticized Umar by referring to as *dha'if*. Ibn Ma'in asserted in Aḥmad bin Abi Khatsimah's narration that there was no problem with Umar, while ibn Hibbān al-Bustī (d. 354 AH) was included in the category of trustworthy narrators (*tsiqat*; 'ādil and *dhābiṭh*). Al-'Asqalānī (d. 852 AH), in his *al-Tabdżīb*, described Umar as a very honest but mistaken person.³⁵ This expression indicates that although Umar was probably wrong, his narration was accurate due to its description from many paths.³⁶ Therefore, the hadīths about the curse of grave pilgrimage for women is *shabīh*.

The narration of Hadīths on the Law of Grave Pilgrimage

Besides the hadīths that curse female grave pilgrims, many hadīth editors support the practice, including:

³³ Ibn Abī Hatīm, *Al-Jarab Wa Al-Ta'dil* (Be'rūt: Dār Ihyā' al-Turath al-'Arabiyyah, 1952).

³⁴ Muḥammad bin Khibban bin Aḥmad, *Masyābir Al-'Ulamā Al-Amṣor Wa Al'Lāmu Fuqabā Al-Aqthār*, I (Kairo: Dār al-Wafā', 1411 H), 35.

³⁵ Al-'Asqalānī, *Tabdżīb Al-Tabdżīb Fi Rijāl Al-Hadits*.

³⁶ Bakar bin Abdullah Abū Zaid, "Juz'un Fī Ziyarāt Al-Qubūr," accessed March 11, 2022, www.du3at.com/islamicbooks/3qeedah.htm.

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو بَكْرِ بْنُ أَبِي شَيْبَةَ، وَمُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ مُنِيرٍ، وَمُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْمُثَنَّى (وَاللَّفْظُ لِأَبِي بَكْرٍ وَابْنِ مُنِيرٍ) قَالُوا: حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ فُضَيْلٍ عَنْ أَبِي سِنَانَ (وَهُوَ ضِرَارُ بْنُ مَرَّةَ) عَنْ مُحَارِبِ بْنِ دِثَارٍ، عَنْ ابْنِ بُرَيْدَةَ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: هَيْئَتُكُمْ عَنْ زِيَارَةِ الْقُبُورِ فَرُورُهَا

Having narrated to us by Abū Bakr ibn Abi Shaybah and Muhammad ibn Abdullah ibn Numair and Muhammad ibn al-Mutsanna (pronounced from Abū Bakr and ibn Numair), they said: narrated to us Muhammad ibn Fudhail from Abū Sinan (i.e., Dhirar ibn Murrāh) from Mubārīb bin Ditsar, from ibn Buraidah, from his father, he said: Rasulullah SAW. said: "I forbid you from grave pilgrimages, then make a grave pilgrimage." (HR. Muslim).³⁷

فَإِنَّهَا وَتَرْقُ (because the grave pilgrimages can remind of the hereafter). Hākīm included الْقَلْبُ وَتَدْمَعُ الْعَيْنُ فَلَا تَقُولُوا هَجْرًا (and soften the hearts and shed tears, and do not speak foul words) and the editorial فَإِنَّهَا تُرْهَدُ فِي الدُّنْيَا (because the grave pilgrimage causes dislike of the world) from a redaction of the hadīths of Anas and ibn Mas'ud, respectively. Also, the editorial of the hadīth of Abū Hurairah r.a. with the *marfu'* status reads زُورُوا الْقُبُورَ فَإِنَّهَا تُذَكِّرُ الْمَوْتَ (come to the grave because it reminds of death).³⁸

A hadīth narrated by 'Ā'isha r.a. also explained the permissibility of grave pilgrimage:

مِنْ رِوَايَةِ بَسْطَامِ بْنِ مُسْلِمٍ عَنْ أَبِي التَّيَّاحِ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ أَبِي مَلِيكَةَ أَنَّ عَائِشَةَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى عَنْهَا أَقْبَلَتْ ذَاتَ يَوْمٍ مِنَ الْمَقَابِرِ فَقُلْتُ لَهَا يَا أُمَّ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِنْ أَيْنَ أَقْبَلْتِ قَالَتْ مِنْ قَبْرِ أَخِي عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ أَبِي بَكْرٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى عَنْهُ فَقُلْتُ لَهَا أَلَيْسَ كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ يَنْهَى عَنْ زِيَارَةِ الْقُبُورِ قَالَتْ نَعَمْ كَانَ يَنْهَى عَنْ زِيَارَتِهَا ثُمَّ أَمَرَ بِزِيَارَتِهَا.

From the narration of Bistham bin Muslim from Abū al-Tayyāh from Abdullah bin Ab Malikah that indeed 'Ā'isha r.a. one day came from the grave, then I asked her: "O Ummul Mukminin, where did you come from?" She replied: "From the grave of my brother, Abdurrahman bin Abi Bakr r.a. Then I asked again: "Has not the Messenger of Allah

³⁷ Abū Husein Muslim bin Al-Hajjaj, *Shahih Al-Muslim*, I (Beirūt: Dār al-Fīkr, 2011), 429-430.

³⁸ Al-'Asqalānī, *Fath Al-Bārī Syarh Shahih Al-Bukhārī*, 174.

forbade to go to the grave?" She replied: "Yes, he used to forbid it, then he ordered to go to the grave." (HR. *Hākīm and Baihaqi*).³⁹

Likewise, with the following hadīth:

حَدَّثَنَا آدَمُ حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ حَدَّثَنَا ثَابِتٌ عَنْ أَنَسِ بْنِ مَالِكٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ قَالَ: مَرَّ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ بِامْرَأَةٍ تَبْكِي عِنْدَ قَبْرِ فَقَالَ اتَّقِي اللَّهَ وَاصْبِرِي قَالَتْ إِيَّاكَ عَنِّي فَإِنَّكَ لَمْ تُصِيبْ بِمُصِيبَتِي وَلَمْ تَعْرِفْهُ فَقِيلَ لَهَا إِنَّهُ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَأَتَتْ بَابَ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَلَمْ يَجِدْ عِنْدَهُ بَوَابِينَ فَقَالَتْ لَمْ أَعْرِفْكَ فَقَالَ إِنَّمَا الصَّبْرُ عِنْدَ الصَّدَمَةِ الْأُولَى. (رواه البخاري).

*Narrated to us Adam, narrated to us Syu'bah, narrated to us Tsabit, from Anas bin Malik ra., He said: The Prophet SAW. met a woman who was crying beside the grave. So, he said: "Fear Allah and be patient!" The woman replied: "Get away from me because you are not afflicted with a calamity like mine — the woman did not know that it was the Prophet — It was said to her that she was indeed the Prophet, then the woman came to the door (house) of the Prophet. She did not find a caretaker in the house. Then, she said: "I do not know that it is you," The Prophet said: "Patience is only at the beginning of disaster." (HR. *Bukhārī No. 1283; Mūslīm No. 2179. This lafaz of hadīth belongs to Bukhārī*).⁴⁰*

Also, with this hadīth:

عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّزَّاقِ عَنْ ابْنِ جُرَيْجٍ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ قَيْسِ بْنِ مَخْرُومَةَ عَنْ عَائِشَةَ قَالَتْ كُنْتُ سَأَلْتُ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ كَيْفَ نَقُولُ فِي التَّسْلِيمِ عَلَى الْقُبُورِ؟ فَقَالَ: قُولِي السَّلَامُ عَلَى أَهْلِ الدِّيَارِ مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَالْمُؤْمِنَاتِ، وَيَرْحَمُ اللَّهُ الْمُسْتَقْدِمِينَ مِنَّا وَالْمُسْتَأْخِرِينَ، وَإِنَّا إِنْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ بِكُمْ لَآحِقُونَ.

*From 'Abd al-Razzāq from ibn Jurāij from Muḥammad ibn Qāis ibn Makbūmah, from 'A'isha, he said: "I asked the Prophet: What did we say when we came to the grave?" The Prophet replied: "Say Assalamu'alaikum (peace be upon you) O occupants of the graves from the believing men and women. May Allah bless those who come first and those who come later among you. Indeed, we, Allah willing, will follow you." (HR. *Mūslīm No. 974*).*

It contradicts this hadīth:

وَعَنْ أُمِّ عَطِيَّةٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا قَالَتْ: هُمَيْنَا عَنْ اتِّبَاعِ الْجَنَائِزِ وَلَمْ يَعْزَمْ عَلَيْنَا مَتَفَقَ عَلَيْهِ

*Umm 'Athiyah ra., said: "We are forbidden to escort the corpse (to the grave), yet she was not earnest (in forbidding)." (HR. *Bukhārī No. 1278; HR. Mūslīm No. 35/54*).*

³⁹ Al-Hākīm: 1/376, al-Baihaqi: 4/78 (al-Maktabah al-Syamilah).

⁴⁰ Al-'Asqalānī, *Fath Al-Bari Syarh Shahib Al-Bukhari*, 176.

And also conflicts with the hadīth below:

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو حُمَيْدٍ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنُ حَامِدٍ الْعَدَلِيُّ بِالطَّابِرَانِ، ثنا تَمِيمُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ، ثنا أَبُو مُصْعَبٍ الرَّهْرِيُّ، حَدَّثَنِي مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ بْنُ أَبِي فُدَيْكٍ، أَخْبَرَنِي سُلَيْمَانُ بْنُ دَاوُدَ، عَنْ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحُسَيْنِ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ، أَنَّ فَاطِمَةَ تَزُورُ قَبْرَ عَمِّهَا حَمَزَةَ كُلَّ جُمُعَةٍ فَتُصَلِّي «
بِنْتُ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ، كَانَتْ وَتَبْكِي عِنْدَهُ.

Narrated from Abū Hamid Ahmad bin Muḥammad ibn Hamid, from Tamim bin Muḥammad, from Mush'ab al-Zubri, from Muḥammad bin Ismā'il bin Abī Fudaik, from Sulaymān bin Daūd, from Ja'far bin Muḥammad, from his father, from Alī bin Husayn, from his father, from Fatimāh bint Muḥammad, the Messenger of Allah. Fatimāh goes to visit the grave of her uncle, Hamzah, every Friday. She prayed and wept beside (her uncle's grave)." (HR. *Hakīm*).

Resolution of the Hadīths Contradiction

In principle, *shahih* hadīth cannot be contradicted by other arguments, such as the Qur'an, fellow hadīths, and reason. However, in practice, contradictory meanings are often found between one proposition and another, leading to the proposition of solutions to such problems by the 'ulamā'.

The contradiction between a hadīth that curses or forbids the grave pilgrimage and another that allows it precedes the following solution stages. *First*, a merger and compromise (*al-jam'u wat tawfiq*) should be made between the two conflicting hadīths when possible, and both must be practiced. *Second*, for hadīths that cannot be compromised, the *nasikh* hadīth (removing the previous law) should be proposed and practiced, leaving the abolished law (*mansūkh*). In cases of confusion between the law that should be practiced (*nāsikh*) and removed (*mansūkh*), the *rajah* (excellent) hadīth should be practiced after *tarjih*. This is done by observing their *rami* characteristics and superiority in the fifty areas of *tarjih* (qualifications). Supposing a qualification between both hadīths is impossible, which is rare, neither should be practiced until the superior law becomes clear.⁴¹

Analysis of Hadīths on Grave Pilgrimages in Producing a Law

Based on the differences and contradictions between the hadīth editors about the grave pilgrimage for women, the following possibilities are:

⁴¹ Mahmud Al-Thahhan, *Taisir Musthalab Al-Hadīth* (Surabaya: Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmī, 2008), 57-58.

First, the practice is prohibited by the redaction of the hadīth narrated by Abū Hurāirah ra., which cursed the female grave pilgrims (*la'ana Rasulullāh ṣaairaat al-qubūr*).

Second, according to the *tafsīl* (specification), (1) the activity is prohibited for women that visit the grave while adhering to hadith *la'ana Allāh/Rasulullāh ṣummarāt al-qubūr* (women who visit the grave often). (2) It is allowed for infrequent visitors (*maṣḥūm mukhālafah*), (3) or at least *makrūh*, by arguing that the woman is impatient and often sad (seeing *'illāt*).

Third, grave pilgrimage is permissible based on the argument that the hadīth of the curse occurred before the dispensation of the Prophet SAW. This is indicated by the hadīth narrated by Abū Baridah, Sayyidāh 'Ā'isha, Anas bin Mālīk, Ummu 'Athiyah, and Sayyidāh Faṭīmāh.

'Ulamā' Commentary on the Grave Pilgrimage Law for Women

Below is an explanation of the differences of opinion regarding the law of grave pilgrimage for women, according to *jūmhūr 'ulamā'* and four *madhābs*/schools:⁴²

First, *jūmhūr 'ulamā'* argued that grave pilgrimage for women is *makrūh* by asserting *اللَّهُ لَعَنَ رُؤَاةَ الْقُبُورِ* (*Allāh curses the women who often visit graves*).⁴³ This is supported by the consideration that women are very emotional (it is easy to grieve) and less able to withstand adversity, causing them to cry and scream.

Second, Madhāb Ḥanafī contended in the *qaūl ashāb* (the most *shabīh* opinion) that the sunnah of grave pilgrimage for women is the same as that of men by affirming: *فَرُؤُوهَا الْقُبُورَ زِيَارَةٌ عَنْ نَهْيِكُمْ* (*I forbid you from the grave pilgrimage, then make a grave pilgrimage*).⁴⁴

Third, Madhāb Mālīkī views this law as *makrūh*, as argued by *jūmhūr 'ulamā'*, while Imām ibn 'Ābidīn (1198-1252 AH)⁴⁵ considered this matter good (*tawfiqun hasanun*).

Fourth, Madhāb Syāfi'ī affirmed that grave pilgrimage for women is *makrūh*, similar to *jūmhūr 'ulamā'*. Imām Syihābuddīn Aḥmad al-Ramlī (d. 957

⁴² See, Author Team, *Al-Mausū'ah Al-Fiqhiyah Al-Kuwaitiyah*, II (Kūwaīt: Wazarah al-Awqaf wa al-Syu'un al-Islāmīyah, 1983), 88.

⁴³ Al-Aini, *Umdah Al-Qari Syarh Shabih Al-Bukhari*, 100.

⁴⁴ Al-Hajjaj, *Shabih Al-Muslim*, 30.

⁴⁵ Imām ibn 'Ābidīn (1198-1252 AH), with the full name Muḥammad Amīn ibn Umar ibn Abd al-'Azīz ibn Aḥmad ibn Abd ar-Raḥīm ibn Najmuddīn ibn Muḥammad alāḥuddīn al-Shāmī, was a prominent *'ulama'* and Islamic jurist who lived in Damascus, Syria, during the Ottoman era. He was the fiqh authority of the Hanafī school, a civil servant titled *Amin al-fatwa*, and composed more than 50 works consisting of a collection of major fatwas, as well as many treatises, poems, and commentaries on the work of others.

AH) explained that (1) pilgrimage is forbidden when it causes grief and tears. In such cases, the hadīth *الْقُبُورُ زُورَاتِ اللَّهِ لَعَنَ اللَّهُ لَعَنَ* (*Allah curses the women who often visit graves*), is applied.⁴⁶ (2) Grave pilgrimage is permitted when the purpose is to obtain lessons or as a form of love and *tabarruk* of pious people, such as the Prophet, wali, and Kiai, without expressions of grief. This permission is for older women, while the younger ones are governed by the *makrūh* law, similar to attending the mosque for congregational prayers.

Fifth, Madhāb Hanbali stipulates grave pilgrimage for women as *tafsil*. The practice is considered (1) *Makrūh*, with the hadīth *عَلَيْنَا يَعْزَمُ وَلَمْ الْجَنَائِزِ اتِّبَاعَ عَنْ نُهَيْتِنَا* (*We are forbidden to follow the corpse to the grave, yet he (Rasulullah SAW) was not serious in forbidding*). (2) *Haram*, where a forbidden outcome is expected to occur because of the hadīth *الْقُبُورُ زُورَاتِ اللَّهِ لَعَنَ اللَّهُ لَعَنَ* (*Allah curses the women who often visit graves*).⁴⁷ (3) *Good*, when a woman walks past a grave, recites greetings, and prays, (4) *Sunnah*, following visitation to the grave of the Prophet and his companions. This involves considering the generality of the propositions advocating grave pilgrimage, which reads: *فَرُزُّوْهَا الْقُبُورَ زِيَارَةَ عَنْ نَهْيِكُمْ* (*I forbid you from grave pilgrimage, then make a grave pilgrimage*).⁴⁸

Conclusion

The conclusion is that differences in hadīths editorials result in varying opinions regarding the grave pilgrimage of women. Therefore, an accurate and accommodative formulation of the law can be produced through a compromise between two hadīths and another. A search of related hadīths found that the multiple and inconsistency justify or result in different laws. The hadīths that curse female grave pilgrims cannot be implemented because many other narrations support the practice. Moreover, the curse is considered to have been *nasākeh* by other hadīths that advocate it. The hadīths that forbid women from the grave pilgrimage are no longer automatically applied unless the *'illāt* that precedes the curse is fulfilled. Therefore, respecting the pros and cons of grave pilgrimage is important, and the differences in the schools of thought should not be the cause of rifts between Muslims. Anti-grave pilgrimage adherents should refrain from misleading the proponents, who should also keep religious norms to avoid committing shirk offenses.

⁴⁶ Al-Aini, *Umdah Al-Qari Syarh Shahih Al-Bukhari*, 100.

⁴⁷ Al-Aini, 100.

⁴⁸ Al-Hajjaj, *Shahih Al-Muslim*, 30.

Bibliography

- Aḥmad, Muḥammad bin Khibban bin. *Masyābir Al-'Ulamā Al-Amṣor Wa Al'Lāmu Fuqahā Al-Aqthār*. I. Kairo: Dār al-Wafā', 1411.
- Al-'Asqalānī, Ibn Hajar. *Bulūgh Al-Marām*. Indonesia: Dār Ihyā' al-Kutub al-'Arabiyyah, n.d.
- . *Fath Al-Bārī Syarb Shabih Al-Bukhārī*. III. Kairo: Dār al-Bayan al-'Arabi, 2007.
- . *Tabdżīb Al-Tabdżīb Fi Rijāl Al-Hadīts*. Beirūt: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 2004.
- Al-Aini, Mahmud bin Aḥmad. *Umdah Al-Qari Syarb Shabih Al-Bukhārī*. VIII. Beirūt: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 2001.
- Al-Alawi, Irfan. "The Destruction of Holy Sites in Mecca and Medina." *Islamica Magazine*, 2006.
- Al-Farizi, Hariz. *Rahasia Ziarah Kubur*. Jakarta: al-Sofwa Subur, 2003.
- Al-Hajjaj, Abū Husein Muslim bin. *Shabih Al-Muslim*. I. Beirūt: Dār al-Fīkr, 2011.
- Al-Hindi, Ḥasan bin Ali al-Qanuji al-Bukhārī. *Fath Al- 'Allam Li Syarb Bulūgh Al-Marām*. I. Beirūt: Dār al-Kutub al-Ilmiyah, 1997.
- Al-Qayyīm, Ibn. *Ighatsab Al-Lahfan*. Jeddah: Majma'a al-Fiqh al-Islāmī, 1432.
- Al-Sa'dī, Abdurrahman ibn Nashir. *Al-Qaul as-Sadid 'ala Syarkeb Al-Tanbihid*. I. Dār al-Tsabat, 2014.
- Al-Shawkanī, Muḥammad bin Abdullah. *Nayl Al-Awtar, "Kitab Al-Jana'iz": Bab Al-Nahy 'an Ittikhadh Al-Masajid Wa Al-Sarj Fi Al-Maqbarah*. Beirūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1995.
- Al-Sijastani, Abū Daūd Sulaiman bin al-Asy'ats. *Sunan Abū Daud*. II. Beirūt: Dār al-Fīkr, 2011.
- Al-Thahhan, Mahmud. *Taisir Musthalah Al-Hadits*. Surabaya: Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmī, 2008.
- Al-Tirmidzī, Muḥammad bin 'Isya bin Saurah. *Al-Jāmi' Al-Kabir Sunan Al-Tirmidzī*. II. Beirūt: Dār al-Gharby al-Islāmī, 1998.
- . *Sunan Al-Tirmidzī, "Kitab Al-Jana'iz": Bab Ma Ja'a Fi Al-Rukhsab Fi Ziyarah Al-Qubūr*. Riyadh: Maktabah al-Ma'arif, 1996.
- . *Sunan Al-Tirmidzī*. Riyadh: Maktabah al-Ma'arif li al-Nasyr wa al-Tawzi', n.d.
- Author Team. *Al-Mausu'ah Al-Fiqhiyah Al-Kuwaitiyah*. II. Kūwaīt: Wazarah al-Awqaf wa al-Syu'un al-Islāmīyyah, 1983.

- Baz, ‘Abd al-‘Aziz ibn ‘Abdallah Ibn. *Al-Fatama Al-Mubimma*. Kairo: Dār al-Ghad al-Jadīd, 2006.
- . *Al-Tabqiq Wa Al-Idab Li-Kathir Min Masa’il Al-Hajj Wa Al-Umra Wa Al-Ziyara ‘Ala Daw’ Al-Kitab Wa Al-Sunna*. Mekah: Mu’assasat Makka lil-Tiba‘a wa al-‘Ilam, 1974.
- Beranak, Ondrej, and Pavel Tupek. “From Visiting Graves to Their Destruction: The Question of Ziyara Through the Eyes of Salafis.” *Crown Papers*, 2009, 1–40.
- Bille, Mikkel. “Dealing with Dead Saints.” In *Taming Time, Timing Death: Social Technologies and Ritual*, edited by D. R. Christensen and R. Willerslev, 137–55. Routledge Tylor & Francis Group, 2016.
- Darsitun, Darsitun, Khariri Khariri, and Darajat Darajat. “Women’s Grave Perspective of Hadīth.” *Journal of Hadīth Studies* 3, no. 1 (2020): 14–22. <https://doi.org/10.32506/johs.v3i1.545>.
- Eickelman, Dale F., and James P. Piscatori, eds. *Muslim Travellers: Pilgrimage, Migration, and the Religious Imagination*. IX. Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1990.
- Halevi, Leor. “Wailing for the Dead: The Role of Women in Early Islamic Funerals.” *Past & Present*, no. 183 (2004): 3–39. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3600859>.
- Ḥanbal, Abū ‘Abdillāh Aḥmad Ibn Muḥammad Ibn. *Musnad Al-Imām Aḥmad Ibn Ḥanbal*. XIV. Kairo: Muasasatu al-Risālah, 2001.
- Hatīm, Ibn Abī. *Al-Jarab Wa Al-Ta’dil*. Beirūt: Dār Ihyā’ al-Turath al-‘Arabiyyah, 1952.
- Ho, Engseng. *The Graves of Tarim: Genealogy and Mobility across the Indian Ocean*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006.
- Idris, Mohd. *Kamus Marbawi*. 1st & 2nd ed. Kairo: Mustafa al-Halby, 1350.
- Kabha, Mustafa, and Haggai Erlich. “Al-Ahbash and Wahhabiyya: Interpretations of Islam.” *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 38, no. 4 (2006): 519–38. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4129146>.
- Leisten, Thomas. “Between Orthodoxy and Exegesis: Some Aspects of Attitudes in The Shari‘a Toward Funerary Architecture.” *Muqarnas Online* 7, no. 1 (1989): 12–22. <https://doi.org/10.1163/22118993-90000245>.
- Mājah, Abū ‘Abdillāh Muḥammad ibn Yazīd Ibn. *Sunan Ibn Mājah*. I. Dār Ihyā’ al-Kutub al- ‘Arabiyyah, n.d.

- Rajab, Ibn. *Al-Dhayl 'ala Tabaqat Al-Hanabila*. IV. Riyadh: Maktabat al-'Ubaykan, 2005.
- Shalabi, Muḥammad Mustafa. *Al-Madkhal Fī Al-Ta'rif Bi Al-Fiqh Al-Islāmī*. Beirūt: Dār al-Nahdah al-'Arabiyyah, 1985.
- Taīmīyah, Ibn. *Al-Radd 'ala Al-Mantiqiyin*. I. Pakistan: Dār al-Tarjaman al-Sunnah, 1976.
- Timo, Ebenhaizer I. Nuban. "The Tradition of Visiting the Graveyard: A Theological Study on the Ways of Timorese Christians Honoring and Remembering the Dead." In *Proceedings of the International Conference on Religion and Public Civilization (ICRPC 2018)*, 16–21. Paris, France: Atlantis Press, 2019. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icrpc-18.2019.4>.
- Zaid, Bakar bin Abdullah Abū. "Juz'un Fī Ziyarāt Al-Qubūr." Accessed March 11, 2022. www.du3at.com/islamicbooks/3qedah.htm.
- Zaydan, Abdul Karim. *Al-Madkhal Li Dirāsah Al-Shari'ah Al-Islāmīyah*. 13th ed. Beirūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1996.